

The Counter-Reformation in Scotland: A Select Critical Bibliography

REV. MARK DILWORTH, O.S.B., M.A., Ph.D.

The first thing to do here is to define one's terms. Counter-Reformation can mean either countering the Protestant Reformation or setting up a Catholic counterpart to it. Though there was no dichotomy between the two, it was the latter which characterised countries such as Italy where the Reformation was successfully resisted but its challenge led to reform from within. In Scotland, however, the unsuccessful efforts to halt the Reformation before 1560 form part of Reformation history, simply because they were unsuccessful. For all practical purposes, therefore, the Counter-Reformation in Scotland means the efforts of the Roman Catholic Church after 1560 to maintain and increase its presence. These may have faltered but they never ceased, until a changed climate of opinion produced almost complete toleration in 1829. At that very time, another factor was rapidly putting an end to what might still be called the Counter-Reformation, namely the arrival in Scotland of Irish Catholics in ever-increasing numbers. Thenceforward the efforts of the Roman Catholic Church were largely directed towards making provision for these immigrants. The limits of this Bibliography are thus from 1560 to the early nineteenth century.

Although the Bibliography will concern itself with printed works, it can be mentioned that important source material is to be found in archives at home and abroad, including the Stonyhurst MSS, the Jesuit archives in Rome and the Barberini collection in the Vatican Library. Two collections, however, are of particular value. The first is the archives of the Congregation of Propaganda Fide in Rome; its holdings are listed in *N. Kowalsky, *Inventario dell' Archivo storico della S. Congregazione "de Propaganda Fide"* (Schöneck/Beckenried, Switzerland, 1961). The greatest concentration of relevant documents is in the nine volumes concerning Scotland in the *Scritture riferite nei Congressi*. Of like importance are the Scottish Catholic Archives in Edinburgh, where a summary handlist of holdings prior to 1878 is in preparation. D. McRoberts, "The Scottish Catholic Archives, 1560-1978", *Innes Review* [IR], 28 (1977), 59-128 outlines the fascinating story of their provenance.

Sadly, there is no modern work covering both the pre-Reformation and post-Reformation Catholic Church in Scotland. J. Walsh, *History of the Catholic Church in Scotland from the*

Introduction of Christianity to the Present Time (1874) used the Scottish sources then available in print, and A. Bellesheim, *History of the Catholic Church of Scotland from the Introduction of Christianity to the Present Day*, trans. D. O. Hunter-Blair (4 vols., 1887-90) broke new ground by using sources from Propaganda Fide. Both are now irreparably out of date, though Bellesheim still holds the field *faute de mieux*. P. F. Anson, *The Catholic Church in Modern Scotland 1560-1937* (1937) divided the contents according to each bishop's period of rule, which at least laid down the groundlines. The same author's *Underground Catholicism in Scotland 1622-1878* (1970) was a gallant attempt to put together the readily available printed materials. W. Forbes-Leith published source material covering most of the period in his two works, *Narratives of Scottish Catholics under Mary Stuart and James VI* (1885) and *Memoirs of Scottish Catholics during the XVIIth and XVIIIth Centuries* (2 vols., 1909). Two points should, however, be made: the extracts are selective and taken from a fairly narrow range of sources, chiefly Jesuit, and the translation at times is far from accurate. Roman sources extending over much of the period are calendared in two articles by C. Burns: "A calendar of Scottish documents in the *Missioni* collection of the Vatican Archives", *IR*, 24 (1973), 51-68 and "Additions to the *Fondo Missioni* handlist", *IR*, 33 (1982), 31-43. Some scattered material is found in official Scottish records, particularly the *Register of the Privy Council*.

The Episcopalian J. F. S. Gordon's attitude of "publish and be damned" has given us an infuriating but undeniably useful compilation consisting mainly of J. A. Stothert's Life of Bishop Hay but also including accounts of other bishops, obituaries of priests and annual clergy lists. It lacks contents and index and is found with various title-pages and dates, e.g. *Journal and Appendix to Scotichronicon and Monasticon* (1867) and *The Catholic Church in Scotland, from the Suppression of the Hierarchy to the Present Time* (1874). Gordon included obituaries of Jesuit priests, but fuller and more recent accounts of these are found in H. Foley's *Collectanea*, which are vol. 7, parts 1 & 2 (1882-83) of his monumental *Records of the English Province of the Society of Jesus*. During the seventeenth century, the Jesuits and Propaganda Fide conducted rival, or at least parallel, missions (the technical term for activity in a non-Catholic country) but in the eighteenth century Jesuits as well as secular priests in Scotland were subject to the bishops appointed by Propaganda Fide. The history of this important body is told in *Sacrae Congregationis de Propaganda Fide Memoria Rerum 1622-1972*, ed. J. Metzler (Rome, 1971-76), a multi-volume work with a Latin title as its contents are written in five modern languages. Articles specifically on the British Isles are, however, in English. Finally, among the introductory works one can mention O. Blundell, *Ancient Catholic*

Homes of Scotland (1907), which surveys some of the influential families who supported the old Church.

The story of the Counter-Reformation between 1560 and c. 1829 can be usefully broken down into smaller periods. The first came to an end in 1603 when James VI moved to London and James Beaton, the last surviving pre-Reformation bishop, died in Paris. During these years 1560-1603, "old" Catholics and their priests still survived in Scotland, while efforts to restore the old religion were made mostly at a political level. Only after 1580 did some Jesuits come from abroad to work for Catholicism at ground level. The background to the period is described in the latter part of various articles in *Essays on the Scottish Reformation 1513-1625*, ed. D. McRoberts (1962, reprinted from *IR*, vol. 10), notably those on Rome and Scotland, Reformation and Repression, and the Political Background. The survival of Catholicism is documented by M. H. B. Sanderson, "Catholic Recusancy in Scotland in the sixteenth century", *IR*, 21 (1970), 87-107. The concern this caused to Protestant church authorities can be seen in *St Andrews Kirk-Session Register 1559-1600*, ed. D. H. Fleming (2 vols. Scottish History Society 1889-90) [SHS], and in *Stirling Presbytery Records 1581-1587*, ed. J. Kirk (SHS, 1981) and R. M. Fergusson, "Presbytery and Popery in the sixteenth century", *Scottish Historical Review [SHR]*, 3 (1906), 20-26, which also deals with Stirling. One wonders if the fairly sparse entries on Catholicism are symptomatic of a deeper problem: were the ministers and elders exceedingly zealous or did Catholicism pose a real threat? For another region, J. Durkan has collated information in "Catholic survival in Glasgow after the Reformation", *St Peter's College Magazine [SPCM]*, 20 (1951-52), 108-14 and "The Catholic survival in the West of Scotland", *SPCM*, 21 (1953-54), 87-91.

Certainly apologists for Catholicism did not surrender too easily. Full information on one of the most notable, together with two little-known texts, is given by *C. H. Kuipers, *Quintin Kennedy (1520-1564): Two Eucharistic Tracts* (Nijmegen, 1964). For Ninian Winzet the two volumes of *Certain Tractates*, ed. J. K. Hewison (Scottish Text Society, 1888-90) are still basic. The best assessment of Winzet is probably that of J. H. Burns, "Catholicism in defeat: Ninian Winzet 1519-1592", *History Today*, 16 (1966), 788-95, while his family connections in South Germany are described by M. Dilworth, "Ninian Winzet: some new material", *IR*, 24 (1973), 125-32. The arguments of these Catholic controversialists are summarised by M. Taylor in his chapter on the Conflicting Doctrines in *Essays on the Scottish Reformation* (mentioned above). Apologists of lesser importance feature in *Catholic Tractates of the sixteenth century 1573-1600*, ed. T. G. Law (Scottish Text Society, 1901). Scots appear to a surprising extent in A. C. Southern, *English Recusant Prose*

1559-1582 (1950). Those who wrote for an international readership did so in Latin: Southern lists Bishop John Leslie's Latin works, while other writers in Latin are noted by J. H. Burns, "Three Scots Catholic critics of George Buchanan", *IR*, 1 (1950), 92-109.

To a large extent the history of the old Church in the decades after 1560 is the history of Scotland itself, but only works concerned directly with Catholicism can be listed here. One production of outstanding value is J. H. Pollen's *Papal Negotiations with Mary Queen of Scots* (SHS, 1901); the same editor's *Mary Queen of Scots and the Babington Plot* (SHS, 1922) 151-68 prints a memoir of the Jesuit, William Crichton. In fact, the historiography of this "political" phase of the Counter-Reformation in Scotland has not advanced much beyond the stage of editing particular documents. Several of the works listed in this Bibliography have reports on the religious state of Scotland and the like, to which may be added the Appendices in Claude Nau's *History of Mary Stewart*, ed. J. Stevenson (1883) and the calendar of documents in M. Dilworth, "Archbishop James Beaton's papers in the Scottish Catholic Archives" *IR*, 34 (1983), 3-8.

Of the three pre-Reformation bishops who continued to serve the old Church, James Beaton, William Chisholm II and John Leslie, not one has an adequate biography, though there is a very useful essay by D. M. Lockie, "The political career of the Bishop of Ross, 1568-80", *University of Birmingham Historical Journal*, 4 (1953-54), 98-145. A Spanish project in 1570 is described in chapter 6 of D. Mathew, *The Celtic peoples and Renaissance Europe* (1933). Political manoeuvres at the end of the century are outlined in F. Shearman, "The Spanish Blanks", *IR*, 3 (1952), 81-103, to which should be added the note in *IR*, 4 (1953), 60 and the comments in *SHR*, 32 (1953), 195-96; also in the same author's "James Wood of Boniton", *IR*, 5 (1954), 28-32 and T. G. Law, "Documents illustrating Spanish policy in the reign of James VI", *SHS Miscellany*, 1 (1893), 1-70. J. H. Pollen, *The Counter-Reformation in Scotland* (1921) is, despite its title, little more than an essay on the Jesuit mission of the 1580s. Information compiled by one Jesuit involved in this is given in "Report of Father Robert Abercrombie, S.J. in the year 1580", ed. W. J. Anderson *IR*, 7 (1956), 27-59. *H. Chadwick, "A memoir of Fr. Edmund Hay S.I.", *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu*, 8 (1939), 66-85 edits a text concerning another Jesuit involved, while P. J. Shearman, "Father Alexander McQuhirrie, S.J.", *IR*, 6 (1955), 22-45 writes about a slightly later one. A problem of procedure and tactics is described by H. Chadwick, "Crypto-Catholicism, England and Scotland", *The Month*, 178 (1942), 388-401.

After 1603 the departure of king and court for London made Catholic political initiatives in Scotland less feasible, while the death of Archbishop Beaton left Scots Catholics without any

obvious focal point. Other priests now joined the Jesuits in their mission activities, but increasingly their efforts were confined to the north-east and south-west, where local magnates were favourable. The year 1603 was not, however, a clear-cut watershed, and various works straddle the two periods. T. G. Law's *Collected Essays and Reviews* (1904) deal with episodes which commended themselves to his lively mind. "Thomas Innes on Catholicism in Scotland 1560-1653", ed. W. J. Anderson, *IR*, 7 (1956), 112-21 does not enhance its famous author's reputation. B. McLennan, "Presbyterianism Challenged: a study of Catholicism and Episcopacy in the North-East of Scotland 1560-1650" (Aberdeen Ph.D. thesis, 1977) shows the three-fold religious division and lists the known Catholic recusants. A. J. Loomie, "King James I's Catholic consort", *Huntington Library Quarterly*, 34 (1970-71), 303-16 attempts to assess the religion of Anne of Denmark, who became a Catholic in Scotland about 1600 and was later queen in London.

D. McRoberts, "Scottish Catholics in the seventeenth century", *SPCM*, 22 (1955-56), 114-20 provides a helpful introductory survey, and important source material is made available by C. Giblin, "The Acta of Propaganda archives and the Scottish mission, 1623-1670", *IR*, 5 (1954), 39-76. A much-quoted, lively account which gives the "feel" of Catholicism in Scotland at the time is Gilbert Blakhal's *A Breiffe Narration of the Services done to Three Noble Ladyes, 1631-1649* (Spalding Club, 1844). D. Mathew, *Scotland under Charles I* (1955) provides an assessment by a non-Scottish historian. The valuable study by G. Albion, *Charles I and the Court of Rome* (1935) tells the story of influential Catholic Scots in London, in particular George Con; another of them is portrayed by W. McMillan, "Robert Philip, Father Confessor to Henrietta Maria" *Records of the Scottish Church History Society [RSCHS]*, 9 (1947) 83-96, 142-54. A well-known work by M. V. Hay, *The Blairs Papers (1603-1660)* (1929) is undoubtedly helpful but, despite its title, is confined almost entirely to the years of the Protectorate. The secular priests increased steadily in numbers and importance. "William Ballentine, Prefect of the Scottish Mission, 1653-1661", *IR*, 8 (1957), 19-20 with several plates, reprints an early biography of their first superior; and the task facing him is seen in "Prefect Ballentine's Report, circa 1660", *IR*, 8 (1957), 39-66, 99-129 (see also *IR*, 9 (1958), 214-15). Both were edited by W. J. Anderson. D. Maclean, "Roman Catholicism in Scotland in the reign of Charles II", *RSCHS*, 3 (1929), 43-54 takes an unsympathetic look at the available statistics.

Some local and more limited studies help to complete the picture. The Countess of Linlithgow's abandonment of Catholicism is described in *The Confession and Conversion of My*

Lady C. of L., ed. G. P. Johnston (1924); the survival of "cultural" Catholicism in D. McRoberts, "Provost Skene's house in Aberdeen and its Catholic chapel", *IR*, 5 (1954), 119-24; a region where Catholics continued to trouble the Kirk in *Extracts from the Presbytery Book of Strathbogie 1631-1654* (Spalding Club, 1843); ecclesiastical forgery perpetrated for the highest motives in D. McRoberts, "Three bogus Trinitarian pictures", *IR*, 11 (1960), 52-67.

Mention has been made of the mission work of the various religious orders. F. X. Martin has dealt with Capuchins in his *Friar Nugent* (1962) and * "A thwarted project: the Capuchin mission to England and Scotland in the seventeenth century, 1608-1660", *Miscellanea Melchor de Pobladura*, 2 (Rome, 1964) 211-41. P. F. Anson has put together information on them in "The Capuchin Franciscans in Scotland", *SPCM*, 18 (1947-48), 68-73. The most famous of them was Archangel Leslie, known as *il Cappuccino Scozzese*: C. J. Gossip unravels fact from literary artistry in "From Monymusk to Metz: Archangel Leslie on the European stage", *Aberdeen University Review*, 46 (1975), 137-50. The essential information on another order of friars is given by A. Ross, "Dominicans and Scotland in the seventeenth century", *IR*, 23 (1972), 40-75. By no means all Scots who became priests returned to work in Scotland, and they are to be found in various posts or religious houses on the continent. There would appear to be a wealth of information on Franciscans; of the various items in the *Innes Review*, one can perhaps select W. J. Anderson, "William Thomson of Dundee, Friar Minor Conventual", *IR*, 18 (1967), 99-111, and the notes on Scots Minims by J. Durkan, *IR*, 21 (1970), 161-70. Both writers give valuable references to British and continental publications. W. Baird's *Genealogical Collections concerning the Sir-Name of Baird* (1870) give more extended coverage to a Catholic family, some of whose members became nuns or Minims on the continent.

In the early seventeenth century, Catholic Scots played their part in academic life on the continent. For the most celebrated, if one leaves aside the perfervid Thomas Dempster, see G. L. Dellavida, *George Strachan* (Third Spalding Club, 1956) and D. McRoberts, "George Strachan of the Mearns, an early Scottish orientalist", *IR*, 3 (1952), 110-28. Much information on the political, religious and literary activities of an eminent Scots Catholic exile is given by W. J. Anderson, "William Chisholm, Bishop of Vaison, 1585-1629", *SPCM*, 22 (1955-56), 148-65. J. Durkan has written much on the subject in the *Innes Review*. One should consult his articles on David Colville, *IR*, 20 (1969), 47-58, 138-49; on Scots in Italy, *IR*, 22 (1971), 12-18; on Scots in Rome, *IR*, 27 (1976), 42-48; on George Thomson and William Chalmers, *IR*, 31 (1980), 45-48. These expatriates glorified Scotland's

Catholic past in writings of which a typical example is George Con's *De duplice statu religionis apud Scotos* (Rome, 1628); and since they did so at the expense of the Irish, some animated controversies were aroused, for which see P. Grosjean, "Sur quelques pièces, imprimées et manuscrites, de la controverse entre Ecossais et Irlandais au début du 17e siècle", *Analecta Bollandiana*, 81 (1963), 436-46.

John Ogilvie, the only Scots victim of the Reformation officially honoured by Roman Catholics as a martyr, owed his fate more to his resolute denial of the spiritual authority of temporal rulers than to the exercise of his priesthood and thus has more than domestic significance. The standard work by W. E. Brown, *John Ogilvie* (1925) needs revision. It should be read in conjunction with W. J. Anderson, "A Jesuit that calls himself Ogilvy", *IR*, 15 (1964), 56-65 and M. Dilworth, "Three documents relating to St John Ogilvie", *IR*, 34 (1983), 51-65, both of which try to correct the historiography. Other articles in the *Innes Review* supplement or correct in more limited areas.

Roman Catholicism became an important political issue once more with the conversion of the Duke of York, who succeeded to the throne as James VII in 1685. The writings of M. V. Hay are too polemical for objectivity and he is an unashamed partisan of James in *Winston Churchill and James II of England* (1934) and *The Enigma of James II* (1938). His *Failure in the Far East* (1956) is unashamedly pro-Jesuit, as well as informative and erudite, but few readers will be convinced by his uncovering of the massive anti-Jesuit plot master-minded by the Scots priest in Rome, Will Leslie. His slight essay, "Too little and too late", *IR*, 6 (1955), 19-21 is a forthright criticism of the seventeenth-century Propaganda Fide. For a brief period in 1686-88, Holyroodhouse became a centre of Catholic activity, with chapel, college and printing-press. An entertaining and highly prejudiced account of the chapel activities comes from Richard Augustine Hay's *Genealogie of the Hayes of Tweeddale* (1835). W. Cowan, "The Holyrood Press, 1686-1688", *Edinburgh Bibliographical Papers*, 6 (1904), 83-100 gives an impressive list of its publications, and others need to be added. Finally, for the work of the priests under James VII and the cataclysmic effect of the Revolution, one should see the two contemporary letters edited by M. Dilworth, "The Scottish Mission in 1688-1689", *IR*, 20 (1969), 68-79.

In the story of the Counter-Reformation in Scotland, the Highlands deserve separate treatment. During the seventeenth century the efforts to promote Catholicism in the Hebrides and west mainland were made mostly by Irish Gaelic-speaking priests, and during most of the eighteenth century the Roman Catholic Church was divided into Highland and Lowland Districts. Indeed, up to the early nineteenth century, the Counter-Reformation was

more successful in the Highlands than in the Lowlands. The basic introduction is given by O. Blundell, *The Catholic Highlands of Scotland* (2 vols., 1909-17), a work which is a compilation of texts rather than the fruit of research but still very useful. Donald Maclean, *The Counter-Reformation in Scotland 1560-1930* (1931) is also helpful, despite being rather too anxious to prove his point, as the evident anti-Catholic bias is counter-balanced by sympathy for the Highlanders.

The scene is set by Duncan MacLean, "Catholicism in the Highlands and Isles 1560-1680", *IR*, 3 (1952), 5-13, and the documentation of the extraordinarily successful efforts of the Irish Franciscans is given in *Irish Franciscan Mission to Scotland 1619-1646: Documents from Roman Archives*, ed. C. Giblin (1964). The same author describes the later Franciscan mission in * "The Mission to the Highlands and the Isles c. 1670", *Franciscan College Annual* (Multyfarnham, 1954), 7-20 and "St Oliver Plunkett, Francis MacDonnell, O.F.M., and the Mission to the Hebrides", *Collectanea Hibernica*, 17 (1974-75), 69-102. Research from the Scottish side has been done by J. L. Campbell, "The letter sent by Iain Muideartach, 12th chief of Clanranald, to Pope Urban VIII, in 1626", *IR*, 4 (1953), 110-16 and "The MacNeils of Barra and the Irish Franciscans", *IR*, 5 (1954), 33-38, while the political aspect is investigated by D. Stevenson, "The Irish Franciscan mission to Scotland and the Irish Rebellion of 1641", *IR*, 30 (1979), 54-61. Irish Vincentians also worked in the Highlands, and an excellent introduction to their mission is found in chapter 3 of M. Purcell, *The Story of the Vincentians* (1973). The efforts and reactions of the Kirk can be seen in two publications of the Scottish History Society: *Minutes of the Synod of Argyll (1639-1661)*, ed. D. C. Mactavish (2 vols., 1943-44) and *Records of the Presbyteries of Inverness and Dingwall 1643-1688*, ed. W. Mackay (1896).

The religious situation in the Highlands changed very much at the end of the seventeenth century. A work of outstanding value is J. MacInnes, *The Evangelical Movement in the Highlands of Scotland, 1688-1800* (1951), which goes far to explain not only the present demarcation of Catholic and Protestant districts but also the deep cultural spirituality held in common by both traditions. For some insight into this, one should dip into the six volumes of A. Carmichael's *Carmina Gadelica* (reprints and later vols., 1954-78). The story of a group of Highland priests is given by M. Dilworth, "Benedictine Monks of Ratisbon and Wurzburg in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries: Emigrés from the Highlands of Scotland", *Transactions of the Gaelic Society of Inverness [TGSI]*, 44 (1967), 94-110; it is significant that in the seventeenth century all came from districts which are now traditionally Protestant, while in the eighteenth century they are from traditionally Catholic districts. The same author's slight

piece, "The Blind Harper and Catholicism", *IR*, 22 (1971), 113-14, draws attention to the transitional period of co-existence on both sides of the Minch. The controversy between W. Ferguson and J. Prebble over the confessional allegiance of the Macdonalds of Glencoe provides a useful insight into the situation at the time and the sources: *SHR*, 46 (1967), 82-87, 185-88; 47 (1968), 203-09. Additional evidence that these Macdonalds were not Roman Catholics but Episcopalian is the complete absence of Glencoe from the documents in the archives of Propaganda Fide. The memory of a priest who died at the hands of the military in Invergarry castle in 1704 is still green; for him see P. L. Butti, "Verbatim extracts from original (manuscript) letters relating to the death of the Rev. Robert Munro, secular priest on the Scots mission", *SPCM*, 5 (1921-22), 131-35.

F. O. Blundell, "Bishop James Gordon and the Highlands of Scotland", *Dublin Review*, 159 (1916), 141-55 describes the "scotification" of the Irish mission work. From then on, certain districts remained strongly Catholic. W. Ferguson, "The problems of the Established Church in the West Highlands and Islands in the eighteenth century", *RSCHS*, 17 (1969), 15-31 portrays the situation. Documentation from the "Establishment" side is given in "Particular Condescendence of some grievances from the Encrease of Popery", *Highland Papers* 3, ed. J. R. N. Macphail (SHS, 1920), 54-62 and "The 'Encreasce of Popery' in the Highlands 1714-1747" ed. N. M. Wilby, *IR*, 17 (1966), 91-115. Basic information from the Catholic side is found in F. Forbes and W. J. Anderson, "Clergy lists of the Highland District, 1732-1828", *IR*, 17 (1966), 129-84. R. Macdonald supplements this in "The Highland District in 1764", *IR*, 15 (1964), 140-50 and "Catholics in the Highlands in the 1760's", *IR*, 16 (1965), 218-20. The changing situation towards the end of the century can be seen in the note by W. J. Anderson, "The Edinburgh Highland chapel and the Rev. Robert Menzies", *IR*, 17 (1966), 195-98.

Local studies make a useful contribution. The most professional of this genre is *The Book of Barra*, ed. J. L. Campbell (1936), but local information and colour can be gleaned from such compilations as C. Macdonald, *Moidart; or, Among the Clanranalds* (1889), J. Grant, *Legends of the Braes o' Mar* (1876), J. G. Phillips, *Wanderings in the Highlands of Banff and Aberdeen Shires* (1881). The text edited by M. Dilworth, "Catholic Glengairn in the early nineteenth century", *IR*, 7 (1956), 11-23, 87-100 portrays a situation surviving from earlier times. A. S. MacWilliam studies two traditionally Catholic districts: "The Jesuit mission in Upper Deeside 1671-1737", *IR*, 23 (1972), 22-39 and "A Highland mission: Strathglass, 1671-1777", *IR*, 24 (1973), 75-102. Highland family letters and oral tradition are used by I. MacKay, "Clanranald's tacksmen of the late 18th century", *TGSI*, 44

(1967), 61-93. Something of the "feel" of Highland Catholicism can be got from following the careers of students at the continental seminaries who became soldiers; see, for instance, John McDonell's autobiography, *Spanish John* (1931). D. Nicholas, "Trusty Neil MacEchan", *SHR*, 29 (1950), 167-72 tells of the South Uist man who was the father of the influential Marshal Macdonald.

In the later eighteenth century emigration was an important aspect of Highland Catholicism; one might describe it as the exporting of the Scottish Counter-Reformation to North America. Prominence is given to Catholic emigrants by J. M. Bumsted, *The People's Clearance: Highland emigration to British North America 1770-1815* (1982) and "Highland Emigration to the Island of St John and the Scottish Catholic Church 1769-1774", *Dalhousie Review*, 58 (1978), 511-27. The impact made by Highland emigration can be seen in *A. A. Johnston, *A History of the Catholic Church in Eastern Nova Scotia* (2 vols., Antigonish, 1960-71); the same author's "A Scottish bishop in New Scotland", *IR*, 6 (1955), 107-24 deals with the Highland priests on their own. For another Canadian province, one should see **The Catholic Church in Prince Edward Island 1720-1979*, ed. M. F. Hennessey (Charlottetown, 1979) and I. R. Mackay, "Glenalladale's Settlement, Prince Edward Island", *Scottish Gaelic Studies*, 10 (1963), 16-24. The most famous emigrant was Alexander MacDonell, pioneer priest in Glasgow, chaplain to the Glengarry Fencibles and later bishop, for whom the best introduction is perhaps *J. E. Rea, *Bishop Alexander Macdonell and the politics of Upper Canada* (Ontario Historical Society, 1974).

The Counter-Reformation in Scotland relied heavily on the colleges on the continent for a supply of priests. Various colleges of religious orders had Scots *alumni*, but only the specifically Scottish seminaries can be considered here. The seminary system was one result of the Council of Trent; for an early Scottish use of this Counter-Reformation type of institution before the Scots colleges came into being, see M. Dilworth, "Scottish students at the Collegium Germanicum", *IR*, 19 (1968) 15-22. Students' registers of the Scottish seminaries are printed in *Records of the Scots Colleges* (New Spalding Club, 1906); this is described on the title-page as volume I but no other was published. The Scots College at Paris was an ancient foundation, rehabilitated and made into a Counter-Reformation institute after 1560. No registers have survived and no adequate account has been written, but volume 2 of Francisque-Michel, *Les Ecossais en France* (1862) gives the background, while the following brief studies are useful. Documentation is provided by the exhibition catalogue, **Souvenirs du Collège des Ecossais* (Paris, 1962) and W. A. McNeill, "Documents illustrative of the history of the Scots College, Paris",

IR, 15 (1964), 66-85. French source material is used by V. M. Montagu, "The Scottish College in Paris", *SHR*, 4 (1907), 399-416 and *G. Daumet, *Notices sur les Establissements religieux anglais, écossais et irlandais fondés à Paris avant la Révolution* (Paris, 1912), 45-88.

Very little has been published on the Scots College at Douai. W. P. D. Wightman, "James Cheyne of Arnage", *Aberdeen University Review*, 35 (1953-54), 369-83 writes about the man honoured as its founder, and H. Chadwick, "The Scots College, Douai, 1580-1613", *English Historical Review*, 56 (1941), 571-85 is likewise good on its early history. A brief account of the college is found in the piece by H. Beylard, "Douai: Le séminaire écossais" in *Les Establissements des Jésuites en France depuis quatre siècles*, ed. P. Delattre, vol. 2 (Enghien, 1953), col. 262-69; see also vol. 4, col. 170-71 for its brief sojourn at Pont-à-Mousson. J. H. Baxter, "The Scots College at Douai", *SHR*, 24 (1927), 251-57 uses Belgian material (though Douai in fact lies in French Flanders). The college in Rome is also lacking in good published work. There is little besides W. E. Brown's essay in *The Scots College, Rome* (1930) and "Abbé Paul MacPherson's History of the Scots College, Rome", ed. W. J. Anderson, *IR*, 12 (1971), 1-172. Only the college at Valladolid (earlier in Madrid) has been adequately dealt with: *M. Taylor, *The Scots College in Spain* (Valladolid, 1971) is competent and well-referenced, though somewhat jejune for the earlier period. The two colleges in France came to an abrupt end after the French Revolution, the other two were refounded and still function today.

The three Scots monasteries in Germany, the so-called Schottenklöster in Ratisbon (Regensburg), Würzburg and Erfurt, merit inclusion because all the monks in the post-Reformation period were Scots. Background and a historical outline are provided by part III (with Appendices) of T. A. Fischer, *The Scots in Germany* (1902). The only monograph in English is M. Dilworth, *The Scots in Franconia* (1974), which takes the story down to 1696. The eighteenth-century monks are listed, with short biographies, in the same writer's "Two Necrologies of Scottish Benedictine abbeys in Germany", *IR*, 9 (1958), 173-203 and "Scottish Benedictines at Würzburg: a supplement to the Necrology", *IR*, 15 (1964), 171-81. Some useful material is printed in *J. Scholle, *Das Erfurter Schottenkloster* (Düsseldorf, 1932). Of the many enlightening articles by L. Hammermayer, some are cited by Dilworth (above), while others are concerned with the considerable contribution made by the monks to German science and culture. Two which carry the story further, however, are **"Die europäischen Mächte und die Bewahrung von Abtei und Seminar der Schotten in Regensburg (1802/03)" *Verhandlungen des Historischen Vereins für Oberpfalz und Regensburg*, 106 (1966),

291-306; *“Katholikenemanzipation in Grossbritannien und die Erneuerung von Abtei und Seminar der Schotten in Regensburg (1826/29)”, *Zeitschrift für bayerische Landesgeschichte*, 28 (1965), 392-459.

In the eighteenth century, small seminaries were founded in Scotland in remote, reasonably secure districts. The college begun at Loch Morar in 1714 moved soon to Scalan in the Braes of Glenlivet, and from 1732 on there was also a separate college for Highland students on the west coast. In 1799, the Scalan college moved to Aquhorties (Strathdon) and in 1829 both Highland and Lowland seminaries amalgamated to form a single national college at Blairs (Aberdeen). The articles by “Glenlivatensis” (A. S. MacWilliam) cover the eighteenth century: “Scalan, 1717-1799”, *SPCM*, 17 (1945-46), 154-59; 18 (1947-48), 27-39 and “The Highland Seminaries”, *SPCM*, 19 (1949-50), 133-39; 20 (1951-52), 20-24, 54-59, 119-23. The same author completes the Highland story in “The Highland Seminary at Lismore, 1803-1828”, *IR*, 8 (1957) 30-38, while valuable material for the Lowlands is supplied by “The College for the Lowland District of Scotland at Scalan and Aquhorties: Registers and Documents”, ed. W. J. Anderson, *IR*, 14 (1963), 87-212.

An important development in the Scottish Counter-Reformation took place in the 1690s when the first bishop in Scotland since the extinction of the pre-Reformation hierarchy was appointed. His career is outlined in G. Bennett, “Bishop Thomas Nicolson”, *SPCM*, 8 (1927-28), 16-30. Data on each bishop, compiled by J. Darragh, is printed in the annual *Catholic Directory for Scotland* (e.g. 1984, p. 19ff.) but does not entirely supersede W. M. Brady’s compilation from Roman sources. This last is vol. 3 of *The Episcopal Succession in England, Scotland and Ireland A.D. 1400 to 1875* (1877), also found with other title-pages and imprints, e.g. *Annals of the Catholic Hierarchy in England and Scotland A.D. 1585-1876* (1883). Various earlier issues of the *Catholic Directory*, published annually since 1829 (which makes it the oldest surviving publication of its kind with an unbroken run), contain useful information on chapels and so on in the eighteenth century but, being unindexed, are difficult to use. Another helpful introductory study is J. Darragh, “The Catholic population of Scotland since the year 1680”, *IR*, 4 (1953), 49-59.

Scottish Catholics naturally allied themselves with Jacobitism: their comparatively minor importance for the Jacobite cause is put into perspective by *Ideology and Conspiracy: Aspects of Jacobitism, 1689-1759*, ed. E. Cruickshanks (1982). Some assessment of their strength can be gained from “Lists of Popish Parents and their Children in various districts of Scotland”, *Maitland Club Miscellany*, 3 (1843), 387-440. In the late 1720s, the Scottish Catholic Church was divided for administrative purposes

into Lowland and Highland Districts, each under its own bishop. The Lowland priests and mission stations are listed by C. Johnson, "Secular Clergy in the Lowland District, 1732-1829", *IR*, 34 (1983), 66-87. At this time, the clergy were split by the charge of Jansenism brought against those of their number who had studied at the Paris college; some much-needed scholarly objectivity is brought to bear on a subject that has generated more heat than light by J. McMillan, "Scottish Catholics and the Jansenist Controversy: the case reopened", *IR*, 32 (1981), 22-33 and "Thomas Innes and the Bull *Unigenitus*", *IR*, 33 (1982), 23-30.

Having supported the losing side, Scots Catholics suffered greatly after the '45; then, under the leadership of the very canny Bishop George Hay, they succeeded to a considerable extent in freeing themselves, in the eyes of their fellow-Scots, from the aura of disloyalty. Very little scholarly work has been done on this period. For Hay himself there is little besides his Life in J. F. S. Gordon's publication (mentioned above) and a derivative work by C. Kerr, *Bishop Hay: A sketch of his life and times* (no date, probably 1930s). Some information is provided by W. J. Anderson, "Signatures to the Anti-Jansenist Formula in the years 1770-1790", *SPCM*, 22 (1955-56), 24-27 with plate. The man who, more than any other, bridged the cultural gap between Catholics and Protestants was Bishop John Geddes. "Ambula coram Deo: the journal of Bishop Geddes for the year 1790", ed. D. McRoberts and W. J. Anderson, *IR*, 6 (1955), 46-68, 131-43 reveals his pastoral and social contacts; "The Autobiographical Notes of Bishop John Geddes", ed. W. J. Anderson, *IR*, 18 (1967), 36-57 are more general. His antiquarian interests are highlighted by A. Ross, "Three Antiquaries: General Hutton, Bishop Geddes and the Earl of Buchan", *IR*, 15 (1964), 122-39. Scotland was not yet ready for tolerant co-existence with Roman Catholics, as one can see from the Declarations and Resolutions in the compilation *Scotland's Opposition to the Popish Bill* (Edinburgh, 1780) and from R. K. Donovan, "Voices of Distrust: the expression of anti-Catholic feeling in Scotland, 1778-1781", *IR*, 30 (1979), 62-76. The traditionally Catholic landed families still played their paternalistic rôle, which comes across in R. D. Thornton, *William Maxwell to Robert Burns* (1979), a book to be used with some caution. Catholic congregations were now, however, being established in the industrial towns. Glasgow is considered by A. S. MacWilliam, "The Glasgow mission, 1792-1799", *IR*, 4 (1953), 84-91; Dundee by the same author, "Catholic Dundee: 1787 to 1836", *IR*, 18 (1967), 75-87 and D. F. Ward, "The Dundee mission in 1804", *IR*, 22 (1971), 46-47.

The 40 crucial and transforming years between the French Revolution and Emancipation are covered by C. Johnson, *Developments in the Roman Catholic Church in Scotland*

1789-1829 (1983), an illuminating work based on the surviving correspondence of bishops and priests. Attitudes changed towards Catholics, owing to factors which affected Scotland and England alike: the French Revolution, the arrival of émigré priests and the alliance between Britain and the Pope. A summary of the British-Roman connection is given by S. Gaselee, "British diplomatic relations with the Holy See", *Dublin Review*, 204 (1939), 1-19, and a factor of significance can be seen in "The exiled Stewarts in Italy 1717-1807", ed. H. C. Stewart, *SHS Miscellany*, 7 (1941), 53-130. The papal envoy to Britain in 1793, Monsignor (later Cardinal) Erskine, was the son of a Scot; his memoirs are printed in W. M. Brady, *Anglo-Roman Papers* (1890). New light is shed on this period by a recent work, M. Buschkühl, *Great Britain and the Holy See, 1746-1870* (1982). J. McGloin has written much in the *Innes Review* about French émigrés, the more important pieces being "The Abbé Nicolas", *IR*, 14 (1963), 10-29 and "Some refugee French clerics and laymen in Scotland, 1789-1814", *IR*, 16 (1965) 27-55. The Catholics' new-found confidence at this time was shown by their use of the printing-press, described by W. J. Anderson, "Father Gallus Robertson's edition of the New Testament, 1792", *IR*, 17 (1966), 48-59. An Edinburgh Catholic was tried for sedition in 1794: differing interpretations of the significance of the outcome are given by W. J. Anderson, "David Downie and the Friends of the people", *IR*, 16 (1965), 165-79 and C. Johnson, "David Downie: a reappraisal", *IR*, 31 (1980), 87-94.

The influx of Irish in the early nineteenth century was not an unmixed blessing, for it removed much of the good-will towards Catholics built up during the Revolutionary and Napoleonic period. The literature on this influx lies outwith the scope of the present Bibliography, but Scottish Catholicism was in fact showing vitality for other reasons besides numerical increase, as B. Aspinwall points out in "Some aspects of Scotland and the Catholic revival in the early nineteenth century", *IR*, 26 (1975), 3-19. Progress towards Emancipation was British and English rather than Scottish and cannot be dealt with here, but the following should be noted: I. A. Muirhead, "Catholic Emancipation: Scottish reactions in 1829" and "Catholic Emancipation in Scotland: the debate and the aftermath", *IR*, 24 (1973), 26-42, 103-20.

Some biographical studies help to build up the picture. T. F. Taylor, *A Profest Papist: Bishop John Gordon* (1958) tells of the Protestant bishop whose orders were declared invalid by Rome, and G. D. Henderson, *Chevalier Ramsay* (1952) of the Ayrshire baker's son who became tutor to Prince Charles Edward and a best-selling French author. Two well-known figures in Rome are portrayed by W. J. Anderson, "Abbé Peter Grant: Roman agent for the Scottish Catholic mission, 1738-1783", *SPCM*, 23

(1957-58), 4-8 and by D. McRoberts, "Abbé Paul Macpherson, 1756-1846", *SPCM*, 17 (1945-46), 108-15. J. Stark, *Priest Gordon of Aberdeen* (1909) concerns a well-known figure in Scotland. One erudite but eccentric priest has made his mark: an early biography is J. M. Good, *Memoirs of the Life and Writings of Alexander Geddes* (1803), a new and more reliable work is R. C. Fuller, *Alexander Geddes: a pioneer of biblical criticism* (forthcoming). In fact, Scottish Catholicism had a generous quota of notable characters at this time. The adventures of a Ratisbon monk who acted as a British secret agent are described by himself in *Narrative of a Secret Mission to the Danish Islands in 1808, by the Rev. James Robertson*, ed. A. C. Fraser (1863). W. J. Anderson, "Sir Gregor Macgregor, Cacique of Poyais", *IR*, 17 (1966), 60-63 tells of a picturesque but temporary attender at the Edinburgh Catholic chapel.

Some particular aspects of Scottish Catholicism are not well signposted but should at least be mentioned. In the area of worship, a pioneer attempt to set the scene is the essay by M. Dilworth on Roman Catholic Worship in *Studies in the History of Worship in Scotland*, ed. D. Forrester and D. Murray (1984). This can be supplemented by W. J. Anderson, "Catholic family worship on Deeside in 1691", *IR*, 18 (1967), 151-56 and D. McRoberts, "The Rosary in Scotland", *IR*, 23 (1972), 81-86. For adjuncts to worship, the following can be mentioned: for building, P. F. Anson, "Catholic church building in Scotland from the Reformation to the outbreak of the First World War, 1560-1914", *IR*, 5 (1954), 125-40; for chalices and vestments, D. McRoberts, "Some post-Reformation chalices", *IR*, 18 (1967), 144-46 with plates, and "Historical needlework", *IR*, 22 (1971), 52-55. A. MacDonell and D. McRoberts, "The Mass Stones of Lochaber", *IR*, 17 (1966), 71-81 is most useful, ranging far wider than the limits of its title.

Not much has been written on education, probably because there was not much to write about. *M. B. Dealy, *Catholic Schools in Scotland* (Washington D.C., 1945) has a chapter on the period before 1829; the author may not have understood Scottish conditions but at least lays down the lines of the subject. A more limited but informative contribution is by W. J. Anderson, "Some notes on Catholic education for Scottish children in pre-Emancipation days", *IR*, 14 (1963), 38-45. Even less has been written on the sociology of pre-Emancipation Catholicism. One can instance the articles of A. Roberts, "Catholic baptismal registers in the City of Aberdeen, 1782-1876", *IR*, 31 (1980), 17-25 and "Catholic Marriage in eighteenth-century Scotland" *IR*, 34 (1983), 9-16. As for priests' family background, one can only make suggestions. Certainly Macdonald and Gordon family histories

would yield some fruit, and another useful work would be Col. Leslie, *Historical Records of the Family of Leslie* (3 vols., 1869).

All due allowance being made for possible lacunae in this list, it should be apparent how unsatisfactory in many ways is the historiography of the Counter-Reformation in Scotland. The general surveys are mostly old and very much out of date; many of the compilations of source material fall short of scholarly standards; biographies of the more important persons are lacking; scholarly monographs can be counted on the fingers of one hand. On the other hand, scholarly articles have been published in a thin but steady stream, particularly in the *Innes Review* and sufficient to illuminate the main outlines of the subject and make clear where the source material can be found. A rich harvest could be reaped by a determined worker in the field. Nor need the researcher have the feeling of working in a narrow field. The Scottish Counter-Reformation has had wide influence in the English-speaking new world, particularly Canada, and has made a notable contribution to the Counter-Reformation on the continent of Europe. This bibliography can fittingly end with two items which simultaneously point a direction and ask a question. The first is *Papers relating to the Scots in Poland 1576-1793*, ed. A. F. Steuart (SHS, 1915): Catholic Scots undoubtedly enjoyed advantages in Catholic Poland compared with their Protestant compatriots, so what influence had the knowledge of this on the morale of Catholics in Scotland? How isolated did they in fact feel? The other item is R. Darowski, "John Hay, S.J., and the origins of philosophy in Lithuania", *IR*, 31 (1980), 7-15. An article concerning the work in Scotland of another contemporary Jesuit called Hay has already been cited. The two men, Edmund and John Hay, worked both in Scotland and on the continent, and it has been said that Scots Jesuits were simply used by their superiors to advance the Counter-Reformation on the continent rather than in their homeland. Did Scots Jesuits in fact contribute more to the Counter-Reformation on the continent or in Scotland?

* An asterisk denotes that an item published abroad and perhaps not easily accessible is available in the Scottish Catholic Archives, Edinburgh.